Art Works | Developing Practice in Participatory Settings

Paul Hamlyn Foundation Special Initiative

Focus Groups – summary of findings

Research carried out as part of ArtWorks North East

Alex Pheby

University of Sunderland

July 2012

Background

The establishment of Focus Groups is part of the activities designed to bring together artists, academics, arts and social sector organisations in a series of critical dialogues, research projects and co-mentoring frameworks, from which will emerge a better understanding of progression and employability where artists are engaging in participatory settings.

ArtWorks North East hosted the first Focus Group meetings in Creative Writing, Dance and Drama, Music, Visual Arts and Film/Media/Animation during spring 2012. Artists (newly qualified, mid career, well established) and academics came together to discuss a range of questions associated with participatory arts practice across the North East. A facilitator led each discussion and note takers captured details of the conversations.

This report provides a summary of the main findings and conclusions, the questions asked and notes of the conversations. These responses will be used to inform the pilot stage of course design and delivery which will start in early 2013.

ArtWorks North East

Summary

What is the scope of existing participatory practice across the north east region, taking into account terms and conditions of employment, numbers of artists employed?	
Findings	• Recent budget cuts have negatively affected participatory arts projects across the board to a currently unknown (but significant) extent. • Supervisory organisations are a requirement for any activities involving children and vulnerable adults (many of which have been cut) limiting possibilities for practitioners to engage with participants. • Outside traditional educational routes (schools/colleges/universities) funding is hard to secure for participatory projects. • Funding bodies can have onerous conditions on funding that limit the value of the participatory practice. • There is a lack of official certification/routes to qualification for arts freelancers that could allow them to operate with participants outside of major (and therefore threatened) funded projects. • It's hard to find information on funded projects to which freelancers might contribute. • Many practitioners are unaware of the benefits projects might have on their practice, or of their suitability for roles in projects. • A database of available practitioners would be useful, as would a direct route from study into participatory practice for students. • While projects are ongoing to address the issues above, funding cuts

	have affected progress.
	• Successful projects (such as those run through the Sage) can indicate possible strategies.
Conclusions	Space exists for the establishment of a sympathetic and informative umbrella organisation for participatory arts which this project could seek to fill, and a role for universities and partner institutions in providing recognised training and qualifications in participatory arts. Development of framework/benchmark documents around participatory arts practice might be a necessary precondition for such an organisation to be workable. Integration with existing projects suffering funding cuts might prevent duplication of effort. Accessible dissemination (probably web-based) of information would be helpful for both participants and practitioners.

How does the range of stakeholder's views and perceptions influence artist engagement with participatory practice?

Findings	• Stakeholders can influence outcomes in ways that practitioners (who are typically less proscriptively goal-centred) find unsatisfactory.
	• Practitioners are often discouraged from participating by the culture of outcomes and evidence.
	• Stakeholders are often reluctant to fund projects that cannot outline achievable outcomes.
	• Stakeholders often enforce content control where practitioners don't believe this is suitable
Conclusions	Guidelines on possible ranges of outcomes/working methods for general and specific projects would be helpful to manage expectations of stakeholders and practitioners. Space for practice-led development of project outcomes should be built into projects. Guidance on demonstrating outcomes should be offered to practitioners. There may be a role for the project in providing a framework through which practitioners and stakeholders can understand a project and their role in it. There be a role for the project in acting as agent/intermediary/conciliation service for participants/stakeholders.

Artists: how do you "grow" into that role? What skills and knowledge do you see developing?

Findings	• Build on pre-existing security in practice.
	• Develop skills as a facilitator.
	• Fostering a sense of creativity alongside discipline.
	• Team working allows practitioners to develop together.
	• Practitioners learn from participants.
	• Working across disciplines helps broaden skills.
	• Diplomacy.
	• Develops knowledge of the participant groups (and their concerns).
	• Teaching skills.
	• Flexibility and adaptability
	• Organisational skills.
	• Openness, empathy, and enthusiasm.
	• Communication skills.
	• Business skills, budget keeping.
	• Research skills (in reaction to participant-led practice).
	• Confidence.

	• Patience. • Knowledge of Health and Safety
Conclusions	The skills learned closely map those which universities seek to develop in their students - placements with participatory arts projects might therefore be mutually beneficial (with the necessary supervision and guidance).

How can we bring about change and growth in initial arts training in relation to participatory which results in effective new curriculum including CPD provision?

Findings	• Training sessions. • Apprenticeships/Traineeships/ Internships. • University/college/community courses. • Informal workshops. • Placements. • Volunteering. • A database of funding opportunities. • A marketplace for artists and funders to meet. • A space for established artists to share their learning and experiences and to make the next steps after leaving college. • Shadowing /mentoring/coaching with the help of local universities. • Information about work placement opportunities for college courses. • Facilitating and supporting independent community projects (bands, drama groups, writing circles, etc.) • Sharing best practice with other arts groups. • Developing business/IT support for independent practitioners. • Scheme to encourage practitioners to offer experience to interested parties in the community. • Professional Practice Award (or equivalent). • Make information on professional qualifications in the area more accessible. • Make information on training and development for practitioners more accessible. • Information and support should be made available for early career practitioners.
Conclusions	Development should focus on the provision of formal and informal courses, on the job placement schemes, and the effective dissemination of information.
Overall Findings	While participatory arts in the North East are varied and widespread, the recent funding cuts threaten their continuing success. There is a need for an informative, supportive, and sympathetic cross-arts organisation to strengthen existing participatory arts practice, and for a programme of developmental courses at all levels to ensure the evolution of arts practice in the region. Where possible, a programme of consolidation and integration of existing provision would be helpful, with an eye to an organisation developing practice from a position of expertise in participatory arts across all areas of practice, and between stakeholders, participants and practitioners.

Focus Group notes:

Group: **Creative Writing Facilitator**: Sharon Taylor
Date: 9th Feb 2012
Note taker: Caroline Mitchell
9 participants

1. What is the scope of existing participatory practice across the north east region, taking into account terms and conditions of employment, numbers of artists employed?

Scope and issues
- This group started trying to define the area of working in participatory settings and how this related to the artist/ writer's identity. Most people prefer to talk about artists/writers working in participatory settings rather than being 'participatory artists'. There also needs to be an understanding of the difference between a writer and a facilitator.

- There are 2 different skill sets involved in this work – writing skills and participatory skills i.e. coaching, facilitating and supporting other people as artists/writers.

- The support infrastructure for this kind of work has changed radically –there has been a reduction in overall strategy and funding for posts like local authority arts officers, arts advisors, arts development officers and specialist advisors for schools. As individual Artists it is now difficult to talk directly to school head teachers although there have been some opportunities through Schools North East and National Association of Writers in Education (*www.nawe.co.uk*). Now that key 'bridging' organizations like Creative Partnerships (CP) have closed there are fewer brokered opportunities. In Co. Durham this kind of work has been devolved to FE colleges and is more focused on vocational courses. Libraries were also a focal point but now minor libraries are closing.

- There is now more of a need for individual artists to be 'entrepreneurial', proactive and confident in making contacts, in their own time and without funding support.

Current work
- There are some very small scale, low key projects happening in community settings (for instance in N Northumberland) but it can be difficult to capture these kinds of activities.

- There are some activities/opportunities coming out of New Writing North (has info about good practice on website such as Cuckoo Quarterly a sustained young people led programme of work and publication), Newcastle Centre for the Literary Arts www.ncl.ac.uk/**ncla**/,*(including unpaid internships) and there are some advisory routes to support arts in schools as part of the artsmark assessment process (ACE recruited a number of Assessor/Advisors as part of new Artsmark application and assessment process)* www.**artsmark**.org.uk *for assessing impact in schools. However key to note that the artsmark criteria includes visual art and design, drama, music and dance with other art forms such as creative writing and digital arts as additional benefits but not essential to criteria. Similarly see infrastructure for Arts Award programme.*

- *Some writers had set up classes themselves within community centres, put out their own adverts and used word of mouth and existing contacts to publicise them.*

- *You can distinguish between running classes for other writers and running classes that enable people who wouldn't consider themselves writers to explore writing as a means of self expression.*

- *Jack Drum Arts **jackdrum**.co.uk/ was mentioned as a group who took on new initiatives in this area.*

- *One participant was working with S Tyneside council writing a tourist app and developing writing for smart phone 'apps' this practice involves interpreting local places through writing in this medium. Also working with classroom teachers looking at how to develop writing across key stages. Another was building software with The Customs House for capturing sharing and making creative and cultural resources accessible.*

Key routes for sharing good practice

- CP had a very good database with reports of good practice representing practitioner and participant viewpoints - is this still accessible?
- Arts Council case studies on line
- New Writing North – Participatory Projects /artists blogs on line to share practice through process(e.g. Dementia and Creative Writing Project which includes both participation and writers commission). Regular e-newsletter also.
- Individual funders e.g. Northern Rock Foundation required evaluation reports for their projects these will be held with individual funders for example see http://www.nr-foundation.org.uk/resources/publications/.
- National Association of Writers in Education has a newsletter that has articles and case studies of good practice.
- Reports of good practice are scattered – partly because there are so many approaches to this kind of work-currently no one point of distribution for sharing good practice or set of guidelines.
- *One participant is doing a literature review about how to assess impact between practitioners, participants and educators as part of an* MA Education (Creative & Critical Practice).
- This lead to a discussion about the need for a framework for participatory evaluation for creative arts. How do we know that work is of 'high quality'? 'Community development work' already has a written framework for this based on similar principles as creative work in community settings perhaps this could be transferred? There are evaluation and impact tools used by New Writing North (NWN) for its own projects against agreed objectives.
- Is there a need for a 'one stop shop' or 'hub' to link things together for writers interested in working in participatory settings- a regional overview? Some thought so. Much work currently is done by word of mouth. For fairness of access there needs to be more work opportunities advertised with clear guidelines about what experience is necessary for doing particular pieces of work. The Midlands (Nottingham) has lots of activity in this area but seems to be a dearth of activities/opportunities for artists in north-east. Could there be a regional net based resource that can be searched depending on interest and art form etc?
- Suggestion that 'The Bridge NE' (lead by The Sage Gateshead) will be for arts organizations to link and communicate between people, with a focus on children and young people, in the future. This could be a useful resource/meeting point for 'participatory practitioners' working with C&YP.
- Arts Council NE also established a participatory arts network currently being developed. There are e-updates and members can upload opportunities to distribute, so self activating.

- There is already a website aimed at schools see http://www.workshopsinschools.co.uk/about.php. This could be a model-it is currently unfunded but could be developed. Noted that visual artists have a web service called Axis www.axisweb.org/
- Helix Arts a currently funding a project to capture and evaluate stories of participatory practice. It is very difficult to capture what is going on in this sector. It is difficult to quantify people's journeys. Evidence is anecdotal. 'How do you put a value (figure) on changing people's lives?'
- In terms of working on university modules about this area one participant thought that there wasn't enough paid work to sustain existing experienced practitioners. There needed to be careful thought about this part of the sector if we were encouraging artists to see this as a vocational area.

2. How does the range of stakeholder's views and perceptions influence artist engagement with participatory practice?

- There are different agendas depending on who you are working with. Stakeholders can be funders, staff working alongside participants, teachers. For one artist 'self-actualisation' of the participant is the priority so the main concern is how successful was the project for the participant, regardless of who is funding it.

- For another writer working in a day centre with older people with dementia the staff worked hard to enable the writer to come in and she took staff views into account so that they could use some of the approaches themselves. In this project using 'Flash Fiction' the artist was conscious of the role of the staff as partners and collaborators. When working with teachers one writer focused on things that are sustainable for the teachers so that project work could be continued. 'Sometimes you have to be creative to please everyone (funders, employers, people who are actually taking part).'

- How aware are writers working in participatory settings of the 'audience' who might consume the work at the end? It depends on the project brief –the process of doing the workshop can be important rather than what they produce. One example was with a project working with young people in a care home there was a conflict between stakeholders because not all the young people wanted to work towards a performance for an audience and others wanted skills. The funder couldn't fund both activities.

- What is the motivation and personal artistic development for the writer? Some writers are working in participatory settings to facilitate their own work-needing an insight into a particular group, for example prisoners. These kinds of 'professional placements' can raise suspicions but equally can be valued by the participants. One focus group participant said that as a commissioner she was interested in 'the selfish artist' who is a writer/artist first and foremost, collaborating with participants in a particular setting and ultimately writing together a quality piece for a wider audience/readership. One writer said that she did not think about the audience until later drafts.

- One writer said there was level of risk for the artist in any commission of this kind –you are agreeing to provide something different from the 'normal' ways of writing for audiences –something that may or may not be published-sometimes things do fail. The artist can be stuck in the middle, a buffer between the participants and the outside world of funders. Writer has to take flack from funders and deal with it in order to do project.

- What works? One writer said she preferred writer in residence work which might include participatory work but where she also had space to write her own work, inspired by the

participatory work. For another the most exciting things were when the collaboration happened 'properly' between the writer and young people when they had time to develop the work and fully collaborate in what ended up as a polished production for their peers. It works if it is highly valued by everyone. Does this mean the outcome has to be of a professional quality for a wider audience? If the aim is to have a process where participants 'self author' then that should be the main priority. Many artists value the readership highly and participatory practice can place high value on the participants.

- Tensions arise when… there are conflicts between artist's creative agenda and what the stakeholders may be nervous of. Artists have to 'manage tension' 'You have to have the option of failure'. The exciting thing about being creative is that you can't plan what's going to happen. I think the most interesting things are unplanned and you need the flexibility to change.' The agenda *should* be creativity and accessing creativity. Some stakeholders can police, tick boxes on a form or intervene. What doesn't happen often enough is where young people are actually part of the whole process. On paper this happened but in reality it is rare. An example of good practice is Cuckoo Quarterly. www.**cuckooquarterly**.com/
- One example of where young people were not in control was choosing a name for a piece of work which was rejected by six different stakeholder/funders because of their priorities. The irony was that the piece was meant to about empowering young people…Difficulties happen if the stakeholder and artist have different aims. Parties need to be clear about if the project is about the process of empowerment or final product: the approaches are different, and neither is qualitatively better or worse. Clearly if a piece is produced mainly by young people it is not going to have the finished 'quality' that a piece solely produced by a professional.

3. Artists: how do you "grow" into that role? What skills and knowledge do you see developing?

Skills
- Understanding the difference been 'process' and 'product'.
- Being aware of boundaries between writing as therapy and writing as creative process. (sometimes groups are funded because they have health outcomes)
- Writing skills/skills of whatever art form is being produced
- Facilitation-group work, group management skills (many writers don't have these skills)
- Diplomacy skills
- 'Real world' skills e.g. knowing how best to work with young people
- Some worries about people doing creative writing in schools without adequate experience of the craft
- Help people to write CV's that best display their skills as writers, facilitators with experience of working with particular groups etc appropriate for the commission
- To develop confidence to stand up for selves as writers in the area of participatory practice with funders/ stakeholders
- Specialist knowledge relating to target group. Possibility of 'tandem training' where artist works alongside a specialist with knowledge of a particular group.
- Knowledge of boundaries-i.e. when writing is a creative process, when educational, when it is a therapeutic process and management of people in groups who may have different needs
- Need range of case studies on different themes including studies of where things haven't worked.
- Flexibility and ability to adapt to the particular situation you are in 'making it happen '. Developing writers as 'creative producers' who can respond creatively to a particular situation.

- Awareness of different levels of basic and literacy skills.

4. How can we bring about change and growth in initial arts training in relation to participatory which results in effective new curriculum including CPD provision?

- Tandem Training – look at examples from community media

- MA in Creative writing –how much work in participatory settings is covered (Teesside and Northumbria courses cover this)

- 'Shadowing' /mentoring/coaching this would be helpful-payment for mentors/coaches. Opportunities for people in early career would be useful. The Northern Cultural Skills Partnership and Creative Partnerships (both now closed) did work on this as have the Sage Gateshead so may provide models which could be collectively reviewed . Development of this was the next stage of the CP work. There is now a gap for brokers between the practitioners and arts organizations.

- Support and professional development for writers in this area is currently self-funded.

- Arts Award Welcome *www.artsaward.org.uk › [Home](#) › [Arts Award support](#)* may be able to help in this area

- The Writing Squad will be available as a network/support for young writers from April 2012 *www.**writingsquad**.com/*
- Mentoring NWN have voluntary mentoring scheme. The Book Trust has funding for mentoring/informal internships for early career and established writers.
- National Association of Writers in Education have a mentor training scheme *www.nawe.co.uk › ... › [Mentoring and Coaching](#) › [Listings](#)*
- Gap in training for internships-particularly ones that can are accessible to people with family commitments.

Focus group notes
Group: **Dance and drama, at Northern Stage.** Kylie Lloyd facilitator
Date: 3rd Feb 2012
Note taker: Sheila Spencer

Present: 9 people including facilitator, from Dance City, Northern Stage, Customs House, and a number of dance and drama freelancers

1. What is the scope of existing participatory practice across the north east region, taking into account terms and conditions of employment, numbers of artists employed?

Opportunities

- There are quite good opportunities, were better before cuts, as several local authorities have cut or lost their arts budgets. Some budgets have put more into widening participation e.g. North Tyneside but this can mean having to "pilot" projects when it is not really necessary to do a pilot.

- It is much more difficult for freelancers to engage with schools and others. Most of the work goes through established organisations, and if you go back to the client after that, you are likely to be breaking your contract with the organisation that acts as a broker. Without those brokers, it is hard to get into a conversation with potential clients.

- The task is made more difficult with the end of brokerage organisations such as Creative Partnerships in Sept 2011.

- There were examples given of attempts to engage with schools with little or even no response to invitations to come to an event, with the problems being loss of match funding and difficulty of getting cover in order to attend events.

- One mixed media artist had set up a training scheme for teachers which was supported by schools.

- Outside schools, there is also a funding barrier. It was felt that you have to find a way in by delivering a social aim and the art form is often not seen as good enough in its own right to merit funding being put in to engage the artist.

- Lots of experience of drama being used as a tool, rather than doing drama for its own sake or exploring life through drama. Have to tell people you are using drama to do the project!

- Shaping the art form to meet the funder's aims may compromise the value and practice of the art form, and sometimes use different methods to the ones you wanted to use. Others felt that you can often do what you wanted to do in the first place, as long as you say something in the bid or in the performance or the feedback about the topic (example was breakdancing and its impact on tackling Anti-Social Behaviour – as long as the young people involved mentioned the impact on reducing the chances of ASB this was fine with funders).

How to find out about opportunities?

Examples given were:

- Regeneration newsletters in some areas e.g. South Shields West Harton monthly

- Dance City gets requests from potential clients, huge demand, around 10-15 a week, often for street/breakdancing workshops. Usually DC choose who they want to suggest – they need to protect their name and reputation, and also need to fit the artist to the project. DC has a list of professional artists and anyone can join that, so DC can then draw on the list to advertise the opportunity to artists they would suggest. This is the "Fit To Lead" list, criteria to get on the list – got to have public liability insurance, CRB check, and First Aid certificates.

- Customs House do something like this as well, but acting as a broker, not offering work to artists or recommending artists to the clients

- Creative Partnerships had a database of artists on their website

- People felt there needed to be something like the Dance City scheme for the drama field.

- This led to a discussion about how the quality of the work done by freelancers is important, but there is no way for community organisations to measure or assess the quality of the artist's work before they engage them. There is no qualification for organisations to see. Some academic courses do have a community module so it becomes the "bread and butter" of artists, but where can you do that?

Good practice in promoting opportunities

- Agency brokering role – relies on artists putting themselves on the list and going through the hoops to get on the list

- Community orgs doing their own research

- How do we know what the funding opportunities are to support the sort of work that we do? Databases of funding organisations but not everyone knew about Fundfinder or FINE or other resources such as Community Foundations.

- This led to a discussion about role of artist as facilitator and how to acquire these skills (see later in response to question 3)

2. How does the range of stakeholder's views and perceptions influence artist engagement with participatory practice?

How stakeholders influence the way that artists engage with practice

- Example of working with 10 young people in a Pupil Referral Unit (for disengaged young people) on the theme of conflict resolution, within self and peers. Used drama in a way that the young people had not experienced before. Artist got the funders to observe first session and saw the investment of the artists and the young people. Teachers liked the model and have taken on the skills to do it themselves. The artist was clear from the start that the art form was central and would achieve what was wanted. Key to this were clear objectives, funders having an open mind, trust and non-intervention by the funders.

- Another example of a schools project with excellent facilitation but interference from teachers, which okay if it is going wrong.

- It can be very hard to show evidence of the outcomes of arts work, not like science. Artists are not trained to be able to show evidence of outcomes, though some said they were able to do this, to show what had changed as a result of their work, and could publish how they did this.

- Could the local universities help with this?? Creative Partnerships had a lot of evidence and tools in their database – what will happen to all of this? Who will use it?

- Some clients want evaluation evidence. Useful to log the process, and also not just show statistics but how participants have gained the skills in the creative process itself.

- Arts Award folders – lots of work.

3. Artists: how do you "grow" into that role? What skills and knowledge do you see developing?

Skills, knowledge and understanding and how to gain those skills:

- The skills are being a facilitator, not directing but allowing students to own the project and run it right through to the performance, empowering students, also adapting your model to different groups.

- Knowing how to get the process going. Asking open questions so people find their own answers, and group to ask the questions. Being able to challenge, and also deal with difficult groups, including people who have not chosen to be there.

- Got to have a sound knowledge of own technique in order to be able to do this.

- Creating a sense of joy and humour but also discipline and setting ground rules. Being a guide.

- Learning to sit down!

- It is the artist's responsibility to make sure they gain the right skills, and really should have somewhere to learn these skills.

Examples of how to gain the skills:

- Mill Workshop 8 week programme, drama workshops, working to aims and objectives, building in social outcomes, learning outcomes

- Royal Scottish Academy runs similar workshops

- A degree course is 50% facilitation 50% practice (not sure where?)

- Work with a colleague (e.g. one person works with someone who is part of the Arts Council development team) and share skills and learning, learn what works and develop your skills as you go

- Apprentice at Northern Stage, strong participation theme, participation leader shows you how, gradually learn the process

- Working across disciplines helps to broaden your skills

- Gaining transferable skills in other areas e.g. sports leadership

- Mentoring – a few schemes mentioned (Culture Works Mentoring list)

4. How can we bring about change and growth in initial arts training in relation to participatory which results in effective new curriculum including CPD provision?

Options for becoming an artist in participatory settings – formal and informal

- Training sessions

- Apprenticeships

- University courses

- Placements

- Volunteering – this is a key way to learn about opportunities and to get into work with organisations

- Events e.g. at Dance City

Gaps

- Ways of learning project and event management skills

- Opps to work across art forms

- A database of opportunities and also funding avenues

- A marketplace (dating opportunity?) for artists and funders to meet

- A space for established artists to share their learning and experiences and to make the next steps after leaving college

- Mentoring with the help of the local universities

- Quarterly art network at Baltic is an opportunity but lots of negative views come out there

- Information about work placement opportunities for college courses

- Sharing experience internationally

Focus group notes

Group: **Film/Media/animation Facilitator**: Holli McGuire

Date: 7th Feb 2012

Note taker: Caroline Mitchell 7 participants

1. **What is the scope of existing participatory practice across the north east region, taking into account terms and conditions of employment, numbers of artists employed?**

Scope

- Artist/practitioners have found work in this area in the past through *Creative Partnerships* (CP) agents although since they closed opportunities have dried up. One had worked with Helix Arts. Another had worked with *Barnardo's*. The *Workshops in Schools* website had been used http://www.workshopsinschools.co.uk/about.php but no actual work had been secured by this. another artist had found work through *Nine Dots* as a broker www.ninedots.org.uk. The children's book centre '*Seven Stories'* had recently advertised work on their website.

- One film maker said he hadn't sought out participatory work but had worked with Northern Stars the young filmmakers' academy based at *Tyneside Cinema* (*www.tynesidecinema.co.uk/young-tyneside/****northern-stars)*** and he was aware that the *Northern Cultural Skills Partnership* had in the past successfully matched artists to schools (NCSP website no longer active).

- One person working in film and video was doing this through a PhD programme at Newcastle where he was helping communities develop a sense of collective action through tv and video work. (note this person also attended first Baltic Visual Arts focus group)

- One person had started her career in this are and had been working in participatory/community radio for 30 years. She had worked with a very wide range of groups making radio programmes of different kinds and in some situations setting up community radio stations. This work had also been in the area of soundscapes and sound art. She took a 'bottom up' approach and most programmes were made collaboratively. Much of the work was to do with increasing confidence. The term artist is not used so much in radio except in 'sound art' - creative /community producer is used more.

Current work available/issues

- Sense that much the funding in this area comes from media work exploring issues of importance to schools, children, young and vulnerable people. A framework for this kind

of work exists although much more difficult since the closure of CP. Much harder to do work with other groups or to create own opportunities. Mainstream broadcasters do no prioritise funding/commissioning participatory programmes even if 'low level local stuff is more important and interesting. It has been difficult to get funding for work outside young people's remit.

- In animation work one participant said that for her animation came second to the welfare of the people she was involved with-it is a tool to be creative. She had set up *HEART Healing Education Animation Research Therapy* – to promote therapeutic use of animation -there's a difference between an artist who goes in to make a film and those who go in to care. The most important quality in her workshops is people/ listening skills etc. This was echoed by another participant 'The stuff is not about what I am doing it's about the group…about them exploring their voice'. Art is a means to get somewhere else.

- The balance between process and product -working in participatory settings can produce quality products. But authored 'art' is not encouraged. For one film/video maker the process of working in schools and with young people was as important as the final product. You enable them to have a voice and keep 'your' voice out of it. Initially it was the film at the end that mattered now the process of getting there is valued. It also depends on the funder. Comment that when films are entered for competitions and festivals some seem heavily edited and produced –how much are they driven by the artist? There are different ways of approaching participatory practice.

Where does work come from and how is this publicised?

- 'People fall into this kind of work'. It becomes an income stream or you become disillusioned (with the industry) or both and participatory work can be energizing in interesting are to work in. But it doesn't seem to be an industry with direct routes into it.

- One participant said that that the area was quite small 'a club' and work was based on personal relationships and people recommending you because of past work you had done. People relied on work from CP for a long time. This was very successful. It is difficult to approach schools without the 'agent' and network approach that CP had. 'The impetus behind creative teaching has vanished overnight with the disappearance of CP. It's a crying shame'. If another network is to be set up then it needs to be meaningful, active and useful.

- Some get work through *New Writing North* and *The National Association of Writers in Education*. The *Tyneside Cinema* has provided quite a lot of 'repeat business'. There has not been any work through *Northern Film and Media* (although they do have a list of people working in this area) -working in participatory settings 'doesn't seem to be an industry job'.

- One animator said artists needed to be able to write successful bids. Another that he had kept going through work of mouth but now he has to sell himself more. Practitioner in radio and sound said she had funded participatory media work through being part of a mixed country group who have over the last ten years had collaborative European projects funded through EC Adult Education/Lifelong Learning directorate.

- Work in participatory settings does not tend to get advertised. You need to publicise that you work in this area –e.g. make it know that as a film maker you do work in schools. It is also about the relationships you make with arts and funding organizations which lead to work. Networks are hidden, they're under the surface. The Community Media Association has an active email list which communicates paid and unpaid work and calls for project funding and partners. Association of Media and Cultural Studies (MECSSA) discussion list is a good place to hear about research lead practice funding and conferences.

- Participatory practice requires a different set of skills. Teachers are now more used to using media technologies so they are working creatively with media in the classroom – almost competing with participatory practitioners. The *Artists Teacher Scheme* developed by the *National Society for Education in Arts and Design* has provided a model. See http://gn.northumbria.ac.uk/gn/exhibitions/artistteacher/

Training/mentoring/'ways in'

- For professionals 'I've never been trained to work with a young person'.

- The new Artworks mentoring scheme was mentioned and it had been supportive and highlighted for one person that even experienced artists can be very isolated working as participatory practitioners. One person had been part of a discussion group at Customs House and this had functioned as a professional support group.

- Where the work is in the area of therapy there can be difficulties and practitioners need to protect themselves-recognition that art therapy training has built in mentoring and supervision-possibility that government is bringing in regulation for participatory practice work? Is there a gap here? How do we ensure quality? Much of the quality is personality driven-excellent practitioners working in the workshop environment. Personal artistic skills need to be complemented with confidence in teaching, group work, setting up realistic and interviews with different groups etc. One practitioner said it was self regulatory –if you are no good don't do it. Is there scope for more links between art/media and education departments? Feedback from project evaluations helps to regulate quality

- There is no direct 'way in' for graduates. There are students interested in this area. Volunteering/internship may be one 'way in' here. Northumbria (Fine art) and Sunderland run modules in this area (in Sunderland a module in Animation called 'applied animation' and in Media part of MA community radio production and management modules and undergraduate level 2 work experience. Students may not be used to the stress of working in community /therapeutic settings and they need to learn to identify what may be difficult.

- In teaching about participatory practice in media at Sunderland the lecturer had to educate students about participatory practice as a new way of seeing themselves as media practitioners. It wasn't necessarily about being an individual presenter, journalist, camera operator or producer it was about working collaboratively with groups in the local community. Sometimes this is in conflict with mainstream media careers advice. Also

several people suggested that the job of teaching media skills was made easier due to the accessibility of new media technologies.

2. How does the range of stakeholder's views and perceptions influence artist engagement with participatory practice?

- Families and carers - quite often they stand back. They are not used to getting involved or getting their hands on-don't really know what animation is. This needs to be encouraged more to bring them into the dynamic.

- Some teachers get involved but most have to be encouraged by practitioners to see the value and relevance of this kind of work. Once they do they can see how media empowerment techniques are directly relevant to students getting confidence, skills and experience through working in participatory projects.

- It depends on who you work with and how much influence they have on the project.

- One participant had struggled with getting support from academic employers when trying to 'fit' participatory practice work into the research targets. There is lack of critical knowledge about the process of working in this way, often in difficult situations. Another said that community media practice had for many years been seen as a 'Cinderella practice' within media studies research and it was only recently that more articles, books, conferences etc were addressing these kinds of issues. Important that education also challenges perceived notions that 'everyone' has access to the media through social media when globally people clearly don't and don't necessarily know how to produce programmes within social media use.

- Participant explained that one way of working more directly with stakeholders is to work 'in tandem' where stakeholders with direct experience of the target group design projects and activities together, planning activities together from the start of the project. See http://www.soundnezz.de/meta/materials/unit3/slide10.pdf

- There has been a change in status for writers working in prisons –it is now acknowledged that they need a range of skills and techniques as well as writing. Their status has changed on the ground but this is not necessarily recognized as they are still called 'writers in prisons.'

- The role of a film writer is to manage expectations of what the project is going to be. People who don't understand the area place low value on it as 'Art" It is best when people understand *why* it is happening. The perceived value of this area of work is a very important thing to address.

3. Artists: how do you "grow" into that role? What skills and knowledge do you see developing?

- Film/craft/technical/theoretical/historical/contextual/people skills

- How to manage people in informal settings

- Understanding/knowledge of target group or community

- Skills depend on what the outcome is. Different working on 'process work' to working on a a product for a specific audience

- Confidence

- Being able to sell the subject to their audience

- Similar qualities to being a teacher

- 'You are teaching people about what you do'

- To have unconditional personal regard to what people are doing in the groups you work with.

- Patience

- Important not to have a pre conceived ideas

- Need to be person centred in approach

- Start off with ideas of the target group

- CPD

- Need to be open to learning new techniques

- Need for CPD in person centred approaches and Cognitive Behavioural Therapy

4. How can we bring about change and growth in initial arts training in relation to participatory which results in effective new curriculum including CPD provision?

What options are available, at any age/stage, to becoming an artist in participatory settings?

- Courses Art Therapy, play therapy, sand therapy music therapy, creative therapy (See for instance Advanced Diploma in the Therapeutic & Educational Application of the Arts (http://www.artspsychotherapy.org/artschild-psychotherapy/play-therapy/94?gclid=CJKkhZid0K4CFSxItAodtlTgWg)

- Taking part in mentoring schemes as mentors (ISIS Arts scheme mentioned)

- People volunteering opportunities to work alongside creative practitioners –this happens in film and community radio

- How to get local authority jobs in arts admin and community arts (do they still exist?) in this area

- Starting own groups and organizations to wiork in specialist areas.

- How many people think of it as a career? 'I'd never thought of it as a career but I've been doing it for 10 years.

- Is there a stigma that this is a second choice to mainstream art? 'As a society we don't value art and they don't value this. People in this sector are more tentative'. There needs to be a shift in the perceived value of this area.

Gaps in provision for practitioners **(group RAN OUT OF TIME HERE)**

- Mentoring

- Supervision

- Developing confidence and promoting yourself to people who might employ you

- There needs to be a meaningful and purposeful network

- Funding

- Permanent employment opportunities- for example there could be jobs in this area for schools with pupils with challenging behaviour.

- Needs to be funded CPD

Group: **Music, at The Sage.** Jim Maguire facilitator

Date: 8th Feb 2012 and 9th May 2012

Note taker: Sheila Spencer

Present:
Part 1: 5 people including facilitator, and project lead
Part 2: 3 people plus facilitator and Steering Group member (additional points from Part 2 are in this type face)

1. What is the scope of existing participatory practice across the north east region, taking into account terms and conditions of employment, numbers of artists employed?

Opportunities for artists
- Lots of opportunities for people who have come through the Sage apprenticeship or traineeship schemes, paid and unpaid, with all the different groups, and in all sorts of settings within the Sage and outside. The Sage has also stimulated lots of other opportunities e.g. CoMusica. Placements are a key element e.g. all community music degree students do placements.
- Also opportunities for music students to do workshops at festivals, to work in care homes, and to use some spaces for free.
- General agreement that opportunities have increased as a result of the Sage programmes, and work has developed as the workforce has grown. At the start people were afraid that the traineeship might lead to lots of musicians around with the skills but not enough work to employ them all but this is not what has happened. Now over 100 people employed by the Sage to do a wide range of types of work, particularly through Accessible Learning Strand. Has also led to development of values and quality judgments, and a shift in attitude to access for all around the region. Music education has gone through a huge change over last 30 years, breaking down barriers, enabling more participation.
- Also opportunities through local authorities, Crisis Skylight, and schools.
- Youth Music and ACE fund lots of opportunities
- D-jaying
- Workshops at festivals, and taking on volunteers to work at festivals, to give them experience of the music business
- Going into schools can be participative for musicians - it's not just about teaching
- Collaboration with other musicians can be participative, helps people to progress their careers
- There is flux in the number of opportunities available

How to find out about opportunities
- MusicLeader and its regional networks (but this is going, will be replaced by the Youth Music Network)
- Sound Sense
- Websites – Arts Council, Musicians Union, etc
- The Sage – freelance opps, traineeship, website
- Generator
- Muso Magazine (classical music)
- Brokers such as Helix Arts – website and a list of people they use
- Repeat work – so networking is really important
- Performing Rights Society
- Generator
- Arts Jobs
- ACE website mailing lists for organisations you want to work with

- Gumtree advert for community music in residential care homes
- Limited opportunities, so often artists have to create their own opportunities
- Can be a matter of survival of the fittest
- Also some artists create opportunities within their own communities – will do this work, whether there is a funding programme for it or not, and see it as more community development than AIPS
- New crops of artists bring their own opportunities
- The funding may be there but it may be hard to match the projects to the funding criteria, and vice-versa – funding-fed or –led?
- For some artists, it's not their primary motivation, but it can be good to have a mixed portfolio which includes the skills for PP
- Some people may not think of it as an option when they could be well suited to doing this
- It can be a challenge for artists – don't see opportunities advertised as much as other avenues, many don't apply for jobs as artists but just do it
- It's a reverse of the usual situation , can create opportunities as the Sage has done
- It starts with networking, working out what is going on in the area, showcasing what you can do, and volunteering
- Developing opportunities through music therapy
- Can be repeat work and personal recommendations

Discussion about quality:
- Assurance of quality can be difficult, you tend to bring in those you already know to work with you, may be brilliant musicians but not necessarily brilliant teachers. There are no benchmarks for quality in this type of work, as there are in formal music teaching settings. Particularly hard where looking for non-traditional musician.

Good practice in publicising opportunities
- Good to have publicly advertised jobs, not just to people already known, so use of websites and also online databases. Arts officers play an important role. Some universities also.
- Brokers such as Helix Arts, the Forge, and music consultants are important, and also the cultural venues, charitable organisations.
- E-mail newsletters
- Cultural ambassadors (e.g. Gateshead)
- Newcastle Gateshead Cultural Venues do share information between themselves about who is around and what opportunities there are
- One participant, a member of a well-known band based in the region, said they were always invited to do this type of work, did not have to look for it

Good practice for the future
- Develop quality standards.
- Promote diversity
- Fair recruitment – open advertising
- Database of musicians, e-mail to advertise new opps
- A bit more focus on learning the lessons learnt at the Sage, especially around recruitment which is a fair and open process at the Sage.
- A site like UK Music Jobs but for participative work, and e-mail newsletters (but these subscriptions cost money - some concern that musicians have to pay to get work , not sure if this happens in other professions?); strong feeling that there needs to be more mainstream publicity sources for PP, so everyone knows where to look for work, and it would raise the credibility of PP as a job and make it more accessible (can be hard to get placements for young people wanting this experience)

- Careers advisors and schools need to know more about music professions including participative work – MU should campaign about this, would open up the field e.g. using music for team building experiences

2. How does the range of stakeholders' views and perceptions influence artist engagement with participatory practice?

Influence by stakeholders

- Stakeholders influence through funding and supporting a particular way of working / type of work. A good partnership will marry project aims with a way of working that will meet those aims, and will agree how it will be done by the deliverer.
- Sometimes influence is negative e.g. do not provide youth workers alongside musicians so project does not deliver as anticipated. Sometimes the commissioner sees the product as more important than the process, and this influences the outcome. Can stem from managers not being clear what is expected so staff working with the musicians can't pass this on clearly.
- Stakeholders' views of participation may be influenced by own experiences of music, or lack of, as well as by money or time available, or lack of experience of working with community musicians, fear of reputational risk, or concern arising from a previous history with that artist
- Can quash creativity, excitement, spontaneity, by having pre-conceived notions about what the experience might be like for participants, can restrict buy-in from participants
- This can lead to micro-managing, being risk-averse
- Some experience of needing to change the plan halfway through a project, possibly because of a practical issue (e.g. safeguarding practices, the rooms available) or finding that the community activists wanted to set something up for young people but have no idea how to work with young people in practice. Also parents may influence a project, have an idea about what they want but it's not realistic, may relate better to traditional education than participatory experiences.
- Would be useful to have some guidelines e.g. this is the sort of situation when you can film your work, and this is not
- Sometimes artists do not know how to put together a good outline of what they do, so people don't know what the process is capable of producing, can lead to poor 2-way communication
- Also important to learn from each piece of work
- Go to be approachable and de-mystify the profession, so that people can feel it's safe to try things out, particularly adults, who are less likely to do this
- It's a reciprocal affair, "a community thing", but not everyone will feel able to do it like they might about something like football – culture and tradition is important, and so role of teachers or parents is important to support the participants to feel safe doing this – and give over the idea that it can be fun
- There's been quite a shift over the last 10 years towards people taking part, it's no longer just about listening or watching, people are having a go and taking ownership of what they do nowadays
- Concern about development of a culture of entitlement through celebrity programmes, mostly about becoming famous where it does not really matter how good you are, more about how entertaining and acceptable you are

3. Artists: how do you "grow" into that role? What skills and knowledge do you see developing?

Knowledge, skills and understanding needed
- Technical proficiency needed, and professional practice, not just the theory, and critical understanding of your practice (pedagogy)
- Understanding of the context, the group, and the organisation
- Organisational skills, preparation
- Got to like people! Empathy and enthusiasm
- Keenness to keep learning, willingness to develop, capacity to reflect
- Confidence
- Flexibility and adaptability
- Work with a group's strengths, ability to challenge them, and set contracts, targets and boundaries
- Work on your own, or in a team, and co-leading
- Actively seeking involvement of participants, and being open and non-prescriptive
- Communicating about what you do and how you make it accessible
- Engaging and communicating with people at their level, and being able to use terms they will understand
- Setting up business and professional processes: how to present and publicise yourself, document what you do, and produce flexible plans
- Researching skills – group needs, background, what experience had already, observing
- Artistic skills critical
- Being an inspiring leader

Commonalities and differences
- All of above other than knowledge of specific groups and organisations, and knowing how long you can work with different groups and when and where
- Being able to read music or make music without reading

4. How can we bring about change and growth in initial arts training in relation to participatory which results in effective new curriculum including CPD provision?

Options to become an artist in participatory settings

Lots of options:
- Sage, Community Music and other degrees, community education modules on other degrees e.g. performing arts
- Youth Leadership: programme for young women in music-making, currently setting up sister course to support to become leaders as a progression route
- Formal programmes CoMusica and other programmes which involve volunteers
- Studentships, Traineeship and Advanced Traineeship
- Introduction to Community Music courses and SoundWave
- Ways into Workshops (MusicLeader North East)
- Module run in the past by Helix on Community Arts degree at Northumbria
- Placement opps

- Northern Sinfonia did some workshops on this, led to some good outcomes but not all good, so they took on an education officer to do this who still goes into schools.
- Examples from school teaching: Qualified Music Educator
- National Music Plan idea of setting standard is contentious as suggests that there might be a standard of community music educator which is different standard to other musicians. It is hard to make a list of competences for community music work, but it would include having

experience as a musician (authenticity) as an essential, but also having experience in more than one type of music. Does this make music teaching different from other art forms?

- Really good to be in a musical group yourself and learn from that experience.
- The Sage interviews people and helps to maintain and upgrade skills.
- There are formal opportunities: Sage, Associated Board, music services, 20,000 Voices, and a range of university courses, music therapy courses

Gaps

- No informal routes into the sector, particularly to move from Level 1 to Level 2
- Practitioner route within creative apprenticeships, and higher level creative apprenticeships - have not happened yet
- Traineeship was meant to open up access for musicians from informal world of music who have no qualifications and don't want to take a degree course, but lots of skills in working in communities, but this has not happened, partly because there are lots of graduates around to fill the places
- Shadowing and mentoring could help, but nowhere informal for people to gain skills who want to move from e.g. singing in a choir to being a music director. Danger of people setting themselves up to do this without yet having the skills.
- Not enough opps for existing participatory practitioners to upgrade skills and reflect / learn from each other and build up own practice.

- The focus group session itself was seen as a good experience for reflecting on practice!

  - Need minimally paid opportunities, taster opportunities at several levels, and opportunities to observe others doing participative work, by being co-leaders, and through volunteer opps and trainee positions, and music leadership skills , can get really good experience in 2 days if well-structured
  - Recognition that people are on a journey and need to get paid appropriately, despite musicians being inherently inclined to share their knowledge and skills
  - Need more national coverage of opportunities like there are at the Sage (including workforce development)
  - Need both formal and informal opportunities
  - Sharing best practice around the region, not necessarily organisations like the Sage doing the work all over the region but helping others to do so
  - Opportunities for people to gain skills to do participative work later in their lives (example of Baltic CPD could be rolled out to the music sector and other art forms)
  - Business development – artists understanding how to run businesses
  - IT skills for music businesses, targeted appropriately
  - A framework is needed for rates for participative work for people with different amounts of experience, which organisations can choose to use

Group: **Visual Arts (Part 1) Baltic.** Helen Burns facilitator
Date: 10th Feb 2012
Note taker: Caroline Mitchell
11 participants

1. What is the scope of existing participatory practice across the north east region, taking into account terms and conditions of employment, numbers of artists employed?

Scope and issues
- There's already a healthy and dynamic environment for collaborating with other artists around the north-east I the area of participatory practice.
- Work spaces like NewBridge, Shed and Lime Street mean that lots of individual artists/graduates have a studio environment to work, discuss new projects and network within and their location means it's possible to build relationships with other artists, the public and make new collaborations with community based projects.
- What (new artists) need is space and time for thinking and reflection.

Funding and status
- There are difficulties around funding restrictions for example one artist said she no longer accepted public funding for short projects because she wanted more autonomy. Another agreed that she wanted the creative freedom and time to work in her own way with community participants although she acknowledged that link with a funder also brought with it recognition for the work.
- Another said that it has been difficult to get Arts Council funding for working in participatory settings (WIPS). Artists working in participatory settings seem to have very low status in the cultural sector and this needs to be explored further. Funding was often 'boxed in' and there was a reluctance to fund artists for community projects even when arts was the vehicle for work.
- Small 'pots' of funding were available from funders such as Northern Rock but large scale funding more difficult to secure.
- E Durham Arts had funding from the Coastal Communities Fund and this had been used to make a calendar in conjunction with schools to promote this local arts network in wider area.

What is good practice?
- There needs to be an open ended, not rigid approach. The artist learning from the group-mutual growth and development. It's important not to go in with 'teacher's head', better to negotiate.

- Working as a creative agent through Cultural Partnerships (CP) had been a good process –underlined the importance of having longer time (e.g. over 3 years) to enable ideas to come from children themselves. You need to build up trust, build in time for discussion and have time to develop relationships. Planning and discussion time is not always valued. This has been backed up by research carried out at Centre for Creativity and Learning at University of Sunderland.

- Mention of UNESCO research that if you work in participatory setting and do a bad project the tension generated can be destructive. One participant noted that tension is not always a bad thing if there is a flexible framework then there may be room for 'healthy' dissent. There can be problems if the outcomes are made exclusively by funders or not properly defined by the artist or participants.

2. How does the range of *stakeholder's views and perceptions influence artist engagement with participatory practice?

Responses

- Consensus amongst people who have a stake in the project means a more effective project at a practical level. If you get people like caretakers and school secretaries involved then the project goes more smoothly.

- Best to involve head and key teachers if you want to ensure that there is a legacy to the project

- Communication is important in terms artists building trust and relationships with people that they are interacting with. All people involved in the project need to be informed e.g. if you are working with young people it is best if carers involved.

- Who takes initial responsibility for the project? Views that the artist needs to take responsibility/ care for the project. However this is difficult for artists when they first graduate and may not have skills relating to training and have little experience as a creative producer.

- Less experienced artists can have problems working with particular groups-they may need mentoring by specialists. Artists need to recognise that they need to work in partnership with specialists and also learn to recognise who the different specialists are. Mention of 'training in tandem' work that takes place in community media settings where creative practitioner works alongside a specialist.

- There are often very high expectations of the artist. Can the artists fulfil all the different functions?
  The role of the 'broker' is important –how much is the artist allowed to work as an artist?
  There are many transferable skills that some artists bring from other areas of work.
  When people first leave college they often do work that they don't have experience for and sometimes they can experience problems because of this. Artists are adaptable and can learn many of the skills needed for working in participatory settings.

- It's the responsibility of the host group to tell the artists if there are particular needs in the group.
  Schools and artists should be protected so need structure in place for this including clear about who needs CRB checks etc.

3. Artists: how do you "grow" into that role? What skills and knowledge do you see developing

Skills and knowledge
- How to handle difficult situations and the ability to say no, for example not putting yourself in a difficult or dangerous situation. Assertiveness, conflict management skills also important.

- Need knowledge and confidence / experience to negotiate costs, rates, materials. Experience/knowledge to plan a project with enough development time for all parties.

- There are differing rates for work. The work done by CP may have 'skewed' people's expectations for work with schools-the rate is lower now. Likely that there are different rates of pay in different arts sectors.

- Knowledge of Health and Safety. Knowledge of evaluation systems.

Mentoring and placements

- Artists need to look for support to avoid being isolated and working with mentors can be very supportive. People mentioned importance of formal and informal mentors in their working lives. How best to introduce mentoring systems? Some people find mentors in their daily lives others have been part of formal schemes. Mentoring at different stages of people's careers.

- In current climate are mentoring schemes drying up? What training is available for mentors funded by the current government? It's quite common that mentors come from a different art form or from outside the arts; if there is 'difference' then people can work on a new challenge together, finding ways forward.

- Being part of an artist network can help with finding advice/mentors or placements. In a project between E Durham Arts Network and Easington Council mentoring was built in.

- Are there still significant placement periods in university arts courses? (these have been beneficial in the past). A two month Baltic gallery placement for University of Newcastle students meant that students could gain in confidence about setting up artwork etc.

Critique and evaluation

- Formal educational methods include group/tutor critiques which force interaction relating to people's practice. Is it useful to recreate this kind of forum so people can critique their work? Some arts organisations have drop in sessions where this already happens (E Durham Arts Network). Some artists build up their own informal networks and get funding to go to different settings to discuss their work.

- How can artists build critique/ critical people into their practice so that they are able to respond when you do get criticism? (c.f. Glasgow School of Art model which ends with tutor giving summative judgement). There will always be people who make judgements including commissioners/funders and we need to have skills for evaluating projects for funders too.

- Discussion about academic criticism, systems for academic assessment and real -life contexts and professionalism. You need criteria for evaluation and critique.

4. How can we bring about change and growth in initial arts training in relation to participatory which results in effective new curriculum including CPD provision?

Responses

- Some courses in the past were oriented towards community arts practices –artists engaged in the community- and had support built in, for instance how you engage with a community when you aren't from it, ethical issues etc.

- ISIS Arts did mentoring schemes which was very helpful to one artist when he was starting out. He was able to work with a mentor to experience what it was like to work in a school-the importance of pre contact etc was basic but helpful.

- Helix had specific schemes so that artists get advice about working with particular groups e.g. young offenders, people with mental health issues. Is there a difference between experiences provided by the cultural sector (real life experience) and experience provided in educational settings?

- Newcastle City Council in 2011 had a day course about working with vulnerable adults

- Baltic has Professional Practice Award (M level). The process that they went through for accreditation was important in terms of ensuring that there was appropriate level of reflection. Formal accreditation may mean that placements etc are more consistent, structured and sustainable. Is this available more widely? Reference to NEArtsworks national scoping study of courses that have elements of participatory practice.
- Discussion about the worth of Masters courses as part of investment in people's careers/practice, artists ability to understand context and to be self reflective. 'Having an understanding of theory and practice leads to a more sustainable practice'.

- There needs to be more information visible about these opportunities (mention of ID Doctorate in Education; MA in Cultural Management) and also accessible information about other CPD opportunities and materials. OU has a portal which offers access to resources/archive materials which might be a useful model to use.
- There needs to be more access for (emerging) artists to courses and workshops that can improve practice. The working context is continually shifting and changing. Could there be an online alert system so that if people want particular courses/opportunities they will be told when they are available?

Other resources that could be use or adapted:
- **50 lessons website-**honest interviews with different businesses *www.**50lessons**.com/*

- Somewhere to… ***somewhere**to.com/*

- **TITLE PENDING**: The Northern Stage Award for New Theatre-interesting model for testing/development of new work that involves critique and mentoring

- scratch… ***scratch**.mit.edu/*

- **Boomerang** http://www.designnetworknorth.org/network/boomerang.asp .Design Network North will send your question out to our members within The Network on your behalf in the hope that someone out there might know something useful. Any replies and recommendations are collated and fed back to you along with relevant contact details.

- Support for early career practitioners. Need for information on 'things that happen to you after you graduate' What is best practice in Arts/creative courses in area of participatory practice?

- Need for courses for self-employed artists. How to 'break through' to the next level of work when you have done lots of basic work in WIPS. Need for professional development in this area. Need to 'invest in yourself'

- Working in participatory settings as part of a PhD project There is-easier to access organisations if you have an educational link. Gives you some status- 'a calling card' . Or you can say you are an associate.

Some concluding statements
Working in participatory settings ' is quite a subtle world to bring into your course'
Unless it's talked about it has a lesser status
Need for more on how to involve or bring in stakeholders into working in participatory settings. 'Dating agency? Who initiates the idea?
Need for artists to get out and experience others' work in this area